G. R. S. IX-5]

Previous references.

File No. 158 of 1900-01.

1900.

(Sanitary)

Serial Nos. 1 – 13

Later references.

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT.

Serial Nos. 1 – 13.

P/ 28/E/1 M ~~Part~~ B for

D. Nagarajan 4.6

SUBJECT.

Abolition of the grant of death Certificates in the city of Bangalore

---

1 Sl 13 D.O dated 15.7.01. (From the J. A. Resident in Mysore)

forwards a copy of the rules and invites reference to the procedure laid down in rules 21

From file

W D 88—GPB—50,000—21-7-16

Code Class. S

INDIAN TELEGRAPHS.

Monthly Number. 729

To (Office.) Bangalore C O

From (Office.) Bakl aspur

Words	Day.	Hour.	Minute.	Official Instructions
43	19	16	38	Secy. to Govt. of India

To (Person.) V. O. Madhava Rao Esq. C. S. I. Member of Council

FILE

From (Person.) Resident Camp Bakal aspur

C 34 Plague administrative what is the present system in Bangalore City about granting death certificates Government of India object to our continuing Hes system in Civil and Military Station Holding that it is akin to corpse inspection and compels relatives to keep corpses for some time in house Kindly wire your Views in full

84 Word Form.

T 14a.

BANGALORE CENTRAL POST 19 JA 01

Recd. from I.N. | Sent to I.N.

41 Hrs. Mts. by | Hrs. Mts. by

Telegraph Master.

(21)

10616

22 Mar: 01 190 /

Pol: 1522

From The H. A. Resident

2596

23-3-01 in Mysore

SECTION Survey:

FILE No. 40 of 1900-01

To The Dewan of Mysore

~~THE SECY. TO THE GOVT. OF MYSORE,~~
~~GEN. & REV. DEPTS.~~

4

Dated 22.3.01

Despatched

Received 4 P.m 23.3.01

General No. 975

No.

Enclosure No.

Enquiring whether, under the circumstances represented, the Durbar will be prepared to follow the course adopted in the C & M Station, Bangalore, in regard to increase of disinfection measures in place of that of examining death certificates,

References to be marked.

Urgent

Forwarded to Hagne Branch

13/3/01

Urgent

No. 975

FROM

THE FIRST ASSISTANT TO THE RESIDENT
IN MYSORE.

To

The Dewan of Mysore.
Bangalore

Dated Bangalore, 22nd March 1901.

SIR,

I am directed to address you about the present practice of requiring the production of a death certificate before burial or burning which now obtains in the Civil and Military Station and the City of Bangalore.

2. The production of a death certificate in the Civil and Military Station prior to removal for burial or burning is now required under Rule 21 of the Rules framed by the Resident under

under the Epidemic Diseases Act 1897 (Vide Residents' Notification No: 1919 D dated the 15th October 1900): In December last the Government of India objected to the system on the ground that it was akin to Corpse inspection which they have entirely prohibited in paragraph 18 of their Resolution in the Home Department No: 1789-1804 dated the 16th July 1900. They pointed out that the advantages aimed at by the Rule Could be secured by treating as due to plague for purposes of disinfection and the like all deaths which are not ascertained to be attributable to any other Cause

3. The Resident in urging a reconsideration of these orders advanced among others the argument that the system observed in the civil and Military Station was on the same lines as that working in the Bangalore city

Where it is believed the inspection of Corpses is always made without any objection having been preferred or any Complaint made as to delay in removing Corpses from houses ~~He~~ from front pointed out that for obvious reasons it was desirable that the same arrangements should operate in the Civil and Military Station and in the city Recognising the force of this argument the Government of India have Consented tentatively to the Continuance of the present system of granting death certificates in the Civil and Military Station.

4. In view of the decrease in the number of plague cases however, the Resident Considers that the time has now come when the desirability of abolishing the grant of death certificates may be taken into Consideration. In the Home Department Resolution of the 16th July 1900 above

referred

referred to it was pointed out.
Even an Experienced Medical
Officer finds much difficulty
in diagnosing Cases of death
from plague Except where there
are clear bubonic symptoms,
and this fact largely detracts
from the value of the death
Certificate. What is desired in
ordinary times is to find out
how many deaths occur per diem,
and this Can be ascertained with
a fair approximation to accuracy
by Careful registration of mortality
Statistics and diligent Comparison
of these figures with the records
of Cremations and burials. The
onus of proving that the Cause
of death was not plague must
then be thrown on the householder
and in all Cases in which this is
not satisfactorily proved, disin-
-fection should follow. The result
I am to point out, is likely to
be a Sensible increase in

measures

measures of disinfection. I am to Enquire whether if this system be adopted in the Civil and Military Station in place of that of granting death certificates, the Durbar will be prepared to follow a similar Course in Bangalore City

I have the honour to be

Sir

Your most obedient servant

L. Ross Major.

First Assistant Resident

CK.

8 Urgent (22)

Here enter letter No. 975 dated the 22nd March 1901 from the First Assistant to the Hon'ble the Resident in Mysore, to the Diwan of Mysore.

FILE No.

SPR[illegible] No. 3

No P.G/215/23-3-01

Copy forwarded to the Mysore Court in Mysore for favor of early opinion

By order

DD 23/3/1901

Dy Secretary

9

Urgent

GOVERNMENT OF MYSORE

23

Letter No. 975 dated the 22nd. March 1901 from the First Assistant to the Hon'ble the Resident in Mysore, to Dewan of Mysore.

I am directed to address you about the present prac-tice of requiring the production of a death certificate before burial or burning which now obtains in the Civil and Military Station and the City of Bangalore.

2. The production of a death certificate in the Civil and Military Station prior to removal for burial or burning is now required under Rule 21 of the Rules framed by the Resi-dent under the Epidemic Diseases Act 1897 (Vide Resident's Notification No.1919 P dated the 15th October 1900). In December last the Government of India objected to the sys-tem on the ground that it was akin to corpse inspection which they have entirely prohibited in paragraph 18 of their resolution in the Home Department No.1789-1904 dated the 16th July 1900. They pointed out that the advantages aimed at by the Rule could be secured by treating as due to plague for purposes of disinfection and the like all deaths which are not ascertained to be attributable to any other cause.

(Copy put up)

3. The Resident in urging a reconsideration of these orders advanced among others the argument that the system observed in the Civil and Military Station was on the same lines as that working in the Bangalore City where it is believed the inspection of corpse is always made without any objection having been preferred or any complaint made as to delay in removing corpses from houses. He pointed out that for obvious reasons it was desirable that the same arrangements should operate in the Civil and Military Sta-tion and the City. Recognising the force of this argument

the

the Government of India have consented tentatively to the continuance of the present system of granting death ~~certificates in Not Notified Wards Omitting Mention of plague~~ death certificates in the Civil and Military Station.

4. In view of the decrease in the number of plague cases however, the Resident considers that the time has now come when the desirability of abolishing the grant of death certificates may be taken into consideration. In the Home Department Resolution of the 16th July 1900 above referred to it was pointed out even an experienced Medical Officer finds much difficulty, in diagnosing cases of death from plague except where there are clear bubonic symptoms, and this fact largely detracts from the value of the death certificate. What is desired in ordinary times is to find out how many deaths occur per diem, and this can be ascertained with a fair approximation to accu-racy by careful registration of mortality statistics and diligent comparison of these figures with the records of cremations and burials. The onus of proving that the cause of death was not plague must then be thrown on the householder and in all cases in which this is not satis-factorily proved, disinfection should follow. The result I am to point out, is likely to be a sensible increase in measures of disinfection. I am to enquire whether, if this system be adopted in the Civil and Military Station in place of that of granting death certificates, the Durbar will be prepared to follow a similar course in Bangalore City.

No. P.S/2/8

Office of the Dewan of Mysore,
Dated Bangalore, 23rd March 1901

Copy forwarded to the Plague Commissioner in Mysore for favor of early opinion.

By Order,

For Secretary.

OFFICE OF THE PLAGUE COMMISSION
Fr. No. 8593
MAR 24 1901

L.B.

LETTER No. 40 of 1900-01

SERIAL No. 64

Vernacular No. 3472-3 25.3.01
Copies to Senior Surgeon L.S.C. & Ch. P.M.O. Bangalore City
for favor of early opinion. PB 25/3/1901

OFFICE OF THE Deputy Plague Officer

No. 25 SECTION

City Bangalore, 24th March 1901.

From

The Deputy Plague Officer

Bangalore City.

To

The Plague Commissioner

in Mysore

Bangalore

(Sl. 57)

Sir

With reference to your memo No. 3812-3 dated the 25th instant forwarding for opinion Copy of letter No. 975 dated the 22nd idem from the First Assistant to the Honble the Resident in Mysore I have the honor to submit the following remarks

2. Inspection although often necessary to determine cause of death may not be made except at the desire of the friends or relations of the deceased who may ask for it with a view to remove suspicion of plague and thereby procure exemption from disinfection &c

Subject to this condition I would recommend that the present system of requiring death certificate be continued both during the

Yours obedient
Servant

Epidemic season and in the ~
interval

3 It is stated that it is often difficult except when bubonic symptoms are clear in diagnosing cases of death from plague even from inspection of corpses by competent Medical Officer this is no doubt very true. But opinion as regards cause of death is not necessarily based upon the corpse inspection. There are various points upon which information can be gathered by making enquiry upon the spot which help considerably in finding out and when more than one death occur at short intervals in the same house or within a circumscribed area that in itself is enough to create suspicion of an Epidemic disease like plague It will not be possible to make this enquiry in most of the cases death if the system of death certificates be abolished. No matter how strict a watch be maintained at the burial and cremation grounds it will not be easy to find out the place of death once the body is disposed off for the purpose of disinfection in the case of suspicion arising. This is not an imaginary difficulty - it was one actually experienced during the first Epidemic

epidemic of plague, more than
half the number of deaths
occurring during the height of
that epidemic used to be returned
as due to other causes - a number
really 8 or 10 times greater than
the normal average no. of
deaths and yet we were quite
unable to localize the deaths
for the very simple reason that
funeral parties would not
give their addresses correctly.

I have the honor to be

Sir,

your most Obedient Servant

G. M. Chalmers

Chief Plague Officer

Bangalore City.

Dr.

14

From

The Senior Surgeon and Sanitary Commissioner
with the Government of Mysore,
Bangalore.

25

To

The Plague Commissioner
in Mysore,
Bangalore.

Dated 1-4-01

No. 871 P (Sl 6)

Sir,

I have the honor to acknowledge the receipt of your No. 3872-3 Dated 25th March 1901, forwarding copy of letter No. 975 dated 22-3-1901 from the First Assistant to the Resident, to the Dewan of Mysore and requesting to be informed if the question of the abolition of death certificates may not be taken into consideration. The object of the introduction of death certificates, and corpse inspection, was of a two fold nature: 1st for the purpose of ascertaining if the case was one of Plague and 2nd to ensure a correct estimation of the total mortality, which prior to the out break of Plague was never known.

I am quite prepared to admit that it is not always possible to ascertain by inspection whether the case is a case of Plague or not, in the absence of buboes this does not detract from the value of corpse inspection as that enables us to detect deaths from other epidemic diseases e.g. Cholera, small pox. If it is abolished now, the result will be that though we shall arrive at a correct estimate of the total mortality, we shall fail to obtain the true cause of death in a much larger number of cases than when an inspection was made, and as the householders will have a great trouble in proving that the case was not one of Plague we shall, as the Honorable the Resident says have a sensible increase in the measures of disinfection, which I am inclined to think the people are more averse to than corpse inspection, as the latter only causes a temporary inconvenience, whilst the

former

From

To

Dated

Despatched

Received

General No. _____
No.

Enclosure No.

Central Jail Press, Bangalore.—21-9-93.—19,302.

former if done efficiently must give rise to endless trouble and annoyance.

Corpse inspection is distinctly a move in the direction of progress, and to stop it would in my opinion be a retrograde step. The aversion to it having been got over here without the slightest trouble, I fail to see why merely because in other parts of India where it is not possible to carry it out, we should be asked to stop it. My views are quite in accordance with those of Doctors Ruffer and Wright, and I look upon corpse inspection as the only means of obtaining the true cause of death, which in a country like India, where registration is so defective, and epidemics so prevalent, is so much to be desired.

I have the honor to be,

Sir,

Your most obedient servant,

Lt.-Colonel., I.M.S.,

Senior Surgeon and Sanitary Commissioner

Mysore Government.

The Darbar have no hesitation in recommending its discontinuance

Continued at least till the cities of Mysore and Bangalore are declared free from P.B. infection.

I have &c

for Secretary

W/4/1901

S.I.B & Gen. Committee for advice. HB 4/4/1901

Well we must discuss approved by the Govt. not be carried through Govt - I think better wait for reply whether approval of Govt of India can really be had for it. I would prefer that we should be repealed. The Secretary will kindly ascertain from D. office

Draft for approval

26 1901

From The Secretary to the Govt of Mysore

To Genl & Rev: Depts.

The 1st Asst to the Hon'ble the Resident

Dated 4th April 1901

Despatched

Received

General No. 13154

No. 2B (P)

Enclosure No.

FILE NO. 40 of 1900-01

Sir,

With reference to your letter No. 975 of 22nd March 1901 regarding the desirability of abolishing the grant of death certificates in the City of Bangalore I am directed to forward herewith

MGCPB—15 1-01—2000

copy of letter No 871 G
1st April 1901 from the
Senior Surgeon & sanitary
Commr with the Govt of Mysore
and copy of letter No 251 G
26th March 1901 from the
Chief Plague Officer, Bangalore City
and to state that the Durbar
generally concurs in the views
expressed therein

I am to add that in the
opinion of the Durbar, the dif-
ficulty of ascertaining the
cause of death and the number
of deaths in any particular
area, from enquiries at re-
mation grounds, is a real one as pointed out by
Dr Cholera, ~~is a real one~~ and that
as the people are not reconciled to the present system

, which is working smoothly & without causing any hardship

and as to advantages in securing correct returns of death & and the cause of

Devasthanam order on letter to Residency No. 13154 P 1 dt 4.4.01
(continued)

13

The Agent Resident what action has been taken on this letter & let me know.

A copy of this cover will be sent to Major Smyth the present Senior Surgeon and he will be asked to favour the Residency with his opinion on the question raised by the Hon'ble Resident

11/4/01

Issued 13/4/01

D.O. letter sent to the F.A. Resy.

Draft & Send to the Sr. Surgeon as directed above.

13/4

Off Subd 13/4/01.

(28)

SECTION L.B.

FILE NO. 40 of 1900-01

SERIAL NO. 68.

Bangalore

12 April 1901

Dear Sir,

Referring to this office letter No. 13154 dated 4 April, concerning the abolition of the E.B.(P.)I system of granting death certificates, I would be glad to know whether any and what action has been taken thereon in the Residency. The opinion of the Head of a present Ag. Senior Surgeon has been called for on the matter; and the

If not already given will kindly favour me with the information at your convenience.

VMM 12/4/01

21

1901

Today

Urgent

Major J. Smyth M.D. I.M.S.
Offg Sr Surgn & S.C.
with the Govt of
Mysore

No 13741
mis 3561 13/4/01
Genl 3

SECTION 2.B
FILE No. 40 of 1900-01.
[illegible] 9

In forwarding herewith
copies of the marginally
noted correspondence on
the subject of the desirability
of abolishing the system
of granting death certifi-
cates in the City of Bangalore,
has the honor to request
that the Offg Senior Surgn
& S. Cons. will favor Govt,
as early as possible, with
his opinion on the question

1) Letter No 975 & 22/3/01
from the T.A. Resdt

2) " Letter No 257 & 26/3/01
from the Chief Mg Offr
Bangalore City

3) Letter No 871 & 1/4/01
from the Sr Surgn

4) Letter No 13154 & 4/4/01
L.F.(P)
to the T.A. Resdt in
Mysore from the Secy
to Govt, Genl & Rev Depts

[illegible] Secretariat Press
4.1

Raised by the Home
the Resident in Mysore

By order

Dewans
orders
Aff

13/4

After using the file will
be returned to the
L B (Plague) Br — at
whom this belongs

Subd Asst Secy
Srirpatna Rao - file 2.J 14/4/01 Read 18/4

18/4/1901

12038
19-4-01 100

L B(P) 450
20/4/01

(30)

From 9296
16-4-01

To The Secretary to Government
General and Revenue
Departments
Bangalore

Dated 13

Despatched

Received

General No.
No.

Enclosure No.

Offering the opinion of the Offg: Senior Surgeon on the Subject of granting death Certificates in the City of Bangalore.

9
18-4-01

ON 20

4 of

10

To be Subd to the Dewan with the file. The Asstt Resident's reply has not yet been received.

18/4

Read
20.4.01

Awaiting from the Residency Submit when rec'd Not rec'd and a reminder issued

23.4.01

Resubmitted with reply received ~~today~~ yesterday.

25/4/1901

Read 6 Pm
25.4.01

rom

The Officiating Senior Surgeon and Sanitary Commissioner
with the Government of Mysore, Bangalore.

To

The Secretary to Government
General and Revenue Departments
Bangalore.

No 9296

Dated 16th April 1901.

Sir,

With reference to your docket No.13741/Mis.3561 dated 13th April 1901, forwarding for my opinion correspondence on the subject of the desirability of abolishing the system of granting death certificates in the city of Bangalore, I have the honor with reference to the Honourable the Resident in Mysore No. 975 dated 22-3-01 to observe as follows, and to begin with I must thank you for enclosing for my information the opinions on the subject under consideration, of officers of such special experience as Colonel Benson the permanent incumbent of this office and of Mr. Choksi, Civil Surgeon and Chief Plague Officer Bangalore city.

2. The object of death certificates should be threefold.

(a) To estimate the death rate and its incidence of a particular epidemic disease, e.g. Plague

(b) To estimate the death rate from individual causations.

(c) To estimate the total death rate.

3. I think I am right in saying that till the out-break of plague in epidemic form in Bangalore, no systematic attempt was ever made in Bangalore, to estimate the death-rate accurately.

Now it is quite clear and unversally recognised that every well regulated community should attend carefully to these matters

alike

alike from a practical and scientific point of view, and my earnest hope is that now that a satisfactory beginning has been made- nay more, now that the work of Registration is being fairly satisfactorily carried out and is organised on fairly good lines, no step shall be taken which shall imperil this useful work in the future. The people of Bangalore are now well accustomed to Registration and only require tact and firmness to establish it as a recognised procedure for all time.

4. At the same time it is right to enquire into the working of the present Registration rules, and where possible, to mitigate their severity, if found severe in any respect. It would appear that the matter of corpse inspection is the point which presents the greatest difficulty just now. Yet Col. Benson in his No.871 of 1st April 1901, near the end, says:- " the aversion to it having been got over here without the slightest trouble I fail to see &c " This being so, certificates after corpse inspection being the right and proper scientific method should be continued. However, while Col. Benson's assertion is quite correct in regard to times of actual epidemic disease I doubt very much whether ~~no~~ in non-epidemic times, actual corpse inspection will continue to be acceptable to the people- Indeed it could only be so to a purely scientific community and the public are anything but scientific here or elsewhere. Rather therefore than wait till the people rose up against this procedure a procedure which they bore with fortitude in epidemic invasion of disease, I think it would be well to relax this rule in non-epidemic seasons. But disposal of the dead without certificate before removal of the corpse from where death took place should not be thought of or permitted for a moment. Better a wrong certificate than no certificate at all. If there is a dispute, the Health Officer should be called in and his decision should be final. Difficulty can only arise in cases of sudden death, and as Mr. Choksi says,

actual inspection of the body is not necessary to enable a skilled Medical Officer to come to a very shrewd conclusion as to

the

Theactual cause of death-itssuddenness., the fact of other recent deaths having taken place there, or in the vicinity, the prevalence of peculiar illness, in the house itself &c &c- these and other points which will suggest themselves to trained Medical men will go a long way- perhaps a much longer way in helping to arrive at a conclusion as to the cause of death than any corpse inspection could do, especially in cases of Plague.

5. I am therefore of opinion that at all times a certificate of the cause (or probable cause) of death should be obtained before removing a dead body from the house in which the death occured. (obviously medico legal cases must be specially dealt with in the ordinary way); but that in time of epidemic the more radical and scientific procedure of actual corpse inspection should be carried out.

I have the honor to be

Sir,

Your most obedient servant

Major I.M.S.

Offg.Senior Surgeon and Sanitary Commissioner

Mysore Government.

2
1

Draft for Approval

Bangalore
24. June 1901.

SECTION L. B.

FILE No. 40 of 1900-01

No 12.

(32)

24/6

Dear Sir,

I am directed to request the favour of your informing me whether any action has been taken in the matter of abolishing the system of granting death certificates, subsequent to your D.O. letter dated 26th April 01, in which you said that the Resident had been consulting the District Magistrate & the Residency Surgeon as to what should be done in the matter. If nothing has been decided as yet, I request you to kindly let me know the existing practice

Lib(P) 310
10.7.01

THE RESIDENT MYSORE

BANGALORE.

SECTION

15th July 1901

FILE No. 404/1900-01.

SERIAL No. 713

Ref. Enq. 5
93
16/1

My dear Sir,

In reply to your demi-official letter of the 24th June 1901 enquiring whether any action has been taken in the matter of abolishing the system of granting death certificates in the Civil and Military Station, Bangalore, I write to say that the matter is still under consideration and that no final orders have yet been passed on the subject. As to the present practice which prevails in the Civil and Military Station I am to invite reference to the procedure laid down in Rule 21 of the Resident's Notification No.1919 F dated the 15th October 1900. A copy of this rule is herewith sent.

Yours truly
L Russell.

Nanjundayya Esquire,

Copy of Rule 21 of the Resident's Notification No: 19196 dated the 15th October 1900.

Enclosure 11

21/ The President of the Municipal Commission may require that no dead body shall be removed for the purpose of burning or burial until a Government Medical Officer, or a Medical practitioner duly authorised in this behalf by the Resident, has granted a certificate testifying to the cause of death. Such certificate shall be prepared in duplicate, one copy being given to the burial party to be presented to the Dean on duty at the cemetery or burning ground the other copy being sent forthwith to the District Medical Officer who shall at once transmit it to the Health Office, unless the Cause of death be certified to be

plague, in which case the district Medical Officer shall send the Copy to the Plague Registrar. For the purpose of the grant of a certificate, the inspection of the corpse shall be in no case Compulsory; but the Resident directs that medical Officers authorized to grant certificates shall, unless the body of the deceased is voluntarily submitted to them for examination, treat the case as being one of plague, and take measures accordingly with regard to the disposal of the body and the disinfection of the house."

Copy

G. S. Tummalai avig aupas

Registrar.